What does this mean for us?
Where will we go from here?
Collective Wisdom: Preserve it, Apply it
HOW?
Connect these ideas in a Transparent framework that teachers and students share:

- Purpose
- Task
- Criteria for Success
Overview

Purpose
- Knowledge: **preserve** your collective wisdom
- Skills: **apply your wisdom**; engage community of practice

Task
- Review the Transparency Framework (I talk)
- Apply (You work collaboratively; 4 steps)

Criteria
- assignment/activity you can use in your course
- helpful insights from colleagues as novices
- Framework for Designing Student Success *Transparency*
Faculty as Designers of Student Success: A Symposium on Teaching & Learning

The University of Utah, J. Willard Marriott Library Gould Auditorium
September 29: 11:30 A.M. – 4:45 P.M. & September 30: 8:00 A.M. – 2:00 P.M.
What is Transparency?

• Transparent teaching and learning methods explicitly focus on *how* and *why* students are learning course content in particular ways.
How can Transparency help students?

- Transparent teaching/learning methods benefit students who are unfamiliar with college success strategies by explicating learning/teaching processes.
  - Greater benefits for underrepresented and first-generation students

Winkelmes. *Liberal Education* 99, 2 (Spring 2013)
Winkelmes et al. *Peer Review* 18, 1/2 (Winter/Spring 2016)
• Partnership with Association of American Colleges & Universities
  – Grant from: TG™ PHILANTHROPY
• Co-PIs: Tia Brown McNair, Ashley Finley, AAC&U
• Schools:
  – Community College of Philadelphia
  – Queensborough Community College, Bayside, NY
  – St Edward's Univ. Austin, TX
  – Univ. of Houston – Downtown, TX
  – California State University, LA
  – Winston-Salem State University, NC
  – Heritage University, Toppenish, WA
• Publication: Peer Review (Spring 2016)
Research Team:

Transparency Project team members, UNLV
Matthew Bernacki, Ph.D. (consultant)
Jeffrey Butler, Ph.D. (research, analysis)
David Copeland (consultant)
Jennifer Golanics, J.D., M. Ed. (analysis)
Sherry Marks (budget)
MaryKay Orgill (consultant)
Kati Harriss Weavil Ph.D. candidate (analysis)
Michelle Zochowski, M. Ed. candidate (analysis)
CONTEXT
Equity of Access

Equity of Experience

Underrep, First Gen, Low Income: half as likely to complete in 4 years

High-achievement in HS can frustrate college success

Gatekeepers
stunt research

Well-prepared novices
don’t think like experts
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHALLENGES</th>
<th>STRATEGIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Lack of Preparation             | • In-class peer and individual work on assignments  
• Evaluate examples of good work in class  
• Review instructions in class  
• Break assignment into smaller pieces with feedback after each due date  
• Explain how to do each step  
• Students use my checklist to evaluate work |
| Motivation                       | • Practice skills in class  
• Begin working on assignment in class  
• Discuss benefits of assignment to their learning; relevance to this class, their life  
• Offer feedback on each piece of project |
| Time Management                  | • Provide time estimates for each step of the project  
• Offer feedback on drafts  
• Early due dates for small pieces of project |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>HURDLES</th>
<th>STRATEGIES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion</td>
<td>Inclusion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goals</td>
<td>Goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>•</td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Connect these good ideas in a framework that teachers and students share:

- Purposes
- Tasks
- Criteria for Success

The questions you want in students’ heads
What does Transparent Instruction look like? 
Handout pages 1-2

Faculty/Instructors agreed (in national study, 7 MSIs) to discuss with students in advance:

**Purpose**
- Skills practiced \( \rightarrow \) long-term relevance to students’ lives
- Knowledge gained \( \rightarrow \) connection to learning outcomes

**Task**
- What students will do
- How to do it (steps to follow, avoid)

**Criteria** for success
- Checklist or rubric in advance so students can self-evaluate
- What excellence looks like (annotated examples where students/faculty apply those criteria)

Winkelmes et al, *Peer Review* (Winter/Spring, 2016)
Transparency and Problem-centered Learning

AAC&U and Transparency Project collaboration

– 7 MSIs, 1800 students, 35 faculty
  • 425 First generation students
  • 402 non-white students
  • 479 low-income students
  • 297 multiracial students

– 2 x small teaching intervention (2 assignments)

– Boosted students’ learning in 3 important ways (medium-large effect for underserved students):
  • Academic confidence
  • Sense of belonging
  • Skills valued most by employers

{Increased GPA, retention}
KEY:  
N: number of students responding |—|: one standard error
ES: effect size (Hedges’ G)  Effect sizes of 0.25 standard deviations or larger are “substantively important” (US Dept of Education WWC, 2014, p. 23).

Less Transparent: mean perceived transparency < 3.3/4
More Transparent: mean ≥ 3.3/4

Baseline Equivalence, Beginning of Term
All Disciplines, All Students

Confidence to Succeed

Please rate your confidence about your ability to succeed in this field.

Please rate your confidence about your ability to succeed in school.

Skills Highly Valued by Employers*

I am capable of learning effectively on my own.

I tend to consider the ethical implications of my actions.

I am able to apply the things I have learned to new problems and situations.

When I get information from multiple sources, I have an easy time making connections between them.

I am good at breaking down theories, ideas and experiences into pieces so I can consider them.

I collaborate well with others on academic work.

I can communicate effectively when I speak.

I can express my ideas effectively when I write.

More Transparent Courses (N=485) Less Transparent Courses (N=630)

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelman
First Generation College Students, End of Term

**Amount of Transparency**
- Less Transparent N=246
- More Transparent N=188

**Employer-valued Skills***
- Less Transparent N=245
- More Transparent N=188

**Academic Confidence**
- Less Transparent N=242
- More Transparent N=183

**Sense of Belonging**
- Less Transparent N=246
- More Transparent N=188


**KEY:**
- **N:** number of students responding
- **ES:** effect size (Hedges’ G) Effect sizes of 0.25 standard deviations or larger are “substantively important” (US Dept of Education WWC, 2014, p. 23).
- **Less Transparent:** mean perceived transparency < 3.3/4
- **More Transparent:** mean ≥ 3.3/4

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelsmes
Impact: UNLV Retention Rates 1st year to 2nd year, 2014-2015

- **All UNLV Retention**: 74.1%  
  N = 2754 / 3716

- **MORE Transparent**: 90.2%  
  N = 1030 / 1143

**red**: UNLV first-time full-time freshman students in all courses AY 2014-2015, including “more transparent” courses, retained in October 2015

**blue**: UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or lower “more transparent” courses Spring 2015, who completed the Fall 2015 term

Sources: UNLV Data Warehouse / MyUNLV Analytics, 5/5/2016; UNLV Registrar; TILT Higher Ed Survey

- **Non-white**: 74.5% (red), 86.9% (blue)  
  - N=1916

- **Hispanic**
  - ES=0.455  
  - p=0.00  
  - 71.3% (red), 90.3% (blue)  
  - N=787

- **Low SES**: 54.1% (red), 94.1% (blue)  
  - N=353

- **African American**
  - ES=0.756  
  - p=0.000  
  - 65.4% (red), 96.1% (blue)  
  - N=176

- **First Generation**: 75.2% (red), 92.1% (blue)  
  - N=408

- **All Students**: 74.1% (red), 90.2% (blue)  
  - N=2754

**red**: UNLV first-time full-time freshman students in all courses, including "more transparent" courses, who were retained in October 2015  
(Source: UNLV Data Warehouse / MyUNLV Analytics, 5/5/2016)

**blue**: UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or lower "more transparent" courses in Spring 2015, who completed the Fall 2015 term  
(Sources: UNLV Registrar and TILT Higher Ed Survey)

* Differences between the two groups will be greater when "more transparent" group is removed from the (red bars) group of UNLV first-time full-time freshman students in all courses.

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelmanes
Impact on UNLV students’ views of learning

Helped Collaborating Effectively: STEM & Life Sciences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean Response</th>
<th>ES</th>
<th>p</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First Generation</td>
<td>144</td>
<td>3.660</td>
<td>0.635</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>African American</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>2.940</td>
<td>0.253</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low SES</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>3.258</td>
<td>0.3281</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>2.907</td>
<td>0.697</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-White</td>
<td>106</td>
<td>3.660</td>
<td>0.649</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>204</td>
<td>3.711</td>
<td>0.679</td>
<td>0.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**First Generation**
- UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or below "less transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015

**African American**
- UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or lower "more transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015

**Low SES**

**Hispanic**

**Non-White**

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelman
Impact on UNLV students’ views of learning

Helped Collaborating Effectively: Humanities & Social Sciences

- First Generation
  - N=240
  - Mean Response: 3.710

- African American
  - N=70
  - Mean Response: 3.649

- Low SES
  - N=193
  - Mean Response: 3.619

- Hispanic
  - N=161
  - Mean Response: 3.600

- Non-White
  - N=265
  - Mean Response: 2.875

**Red:** UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or below "less transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015

**Blue:** UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or lower "more transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelmes
Impact on UNLV students’ views of learning

Helped Communicating: Writing, STEM & Life Sciences

- First Generation: N=144, ES=0.957, p=0.000
- African American: N=31, ES=0.724, p=0.006
- Low SES: N=122, ES=0.793, p=0.000
- Hispanic: N=106, ES=0.895, p=0.000
- Non-White: N=215, ES=0.737, p=0.000

Red: UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or below "less transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015
Blue: UNLV students enrolled in 100-level or lower "more transparent" courses Spring 2015-Fall 2015

© 2014 Mary-Ann Winkelman
Sample Assignments

Sample A

Purpose

- Skills practiced  
  long-term (problem-centered) relevance to students’ lives
- Knowledge gained  
  connection to learning outcomes

Task: What to do

How to do it (steps to follow, avoid)

Criteria

- Checklist or rubric in advance to help students to self-evaluate
- What excellence looks like (multiple annotated examples)
Sample Assignments

Purpose

• Skills practiced
• Knowledge gained

relevance to students
connection to LOs

Task: What to do
How to do it

Criteria

• What excellence looks like (annotated)
• Criteria in advance to help students to self-evaluate

Problem-centered
Sample Assignments

**Purpose**
- Skills practiced
- Knowledge gained

**Task:** What to do; How to do it

**Criteria**
- What excellence looks like (annotated)
- Criteria in advance to help students to self-evaluate

relevance to students
connection to LOs
Sample Assignments

Sample D

Purpose
- Skills practiced  }  relevance to students
- Knowledge gained  }  connection to LOs

Task  (problem-based, relevant)
- What to do; How to do it

Criteria
- What excellence looks like (annotated)
- Criteria in advance to help students to self-evaluate
You work together:
Why are we doing this now?

Purpose
– Knowledge: **preserve** your collective wisdom
– Skills: **apply your wisdom**; engage community of practice

Task
– 4 steps (guided)

Criteria
– assignment/activity you can use in your course
– helpful insights from colleagues as novices
– Framework for Designing Student Success *Transparently*
Set up

1. Volunteers: Who has an assignment/activity for their course – 1st half of term?
   • after students are acquainted with basic tools and terminology the course uses
   • when students are starting to apply those and try them out

2. Sit with disciplinary strangers to gather feedback
Choose an Assignment/Activity from Your Course

- after students are acquainted with basic tools and terminology the course uses
- when students are starting to apply those and try them out

Describe this assignment to your partners (2 min each)
Feedback on Your Assignments, part 1 of 3

As a novice student, offer feedback on the **Purpose**

In groups, discuss and define (2 min)

Five years after taking your course,

- What essential **knowledge** should students retain from doing this assignment?
- What **skills** should students be able to perform from doing this assignment? Why are these important to students?
Faculty as Designers of Student Success
Best Practices I Can Adopt

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your challenges</th>
<th>Your strategies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technology</td>
<td>Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inclusion</td>
<td>Task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Criteria</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Feedback on Your Assignments, part 2 of 3

As a novice student, offer feedback on the Task.

In groups, discuss and define (2 min)

As a novice, list the steps you’d take to do the assignment.
Feedback on Your Assignments, part 3 of 3

As a novice student, offer feedback on the **Criteria**

In groups, discuss and define (2 min)

As a novice:

– Are you confident you are doing the task effectively?
– Are you confident you are doing excellent work?
– Do you have annotated good examples?

To answer yes, what would you need?
How did we do?

Purpose
- Knowledge: preserve your collective wisdom
- Skills: apply your wisdom; engage community of practice

Task
- Review the Transparency Framework (I talk)
- Apply (You work collaboratively; 4 steps)

Criteria
- assignment/activity you can use in your course
- helpful insights from colleagues as novices
- Framework for Designing Student Success Transparently
Faculty as Designers of Student Success:

The University of Utah, J. Willard Marriott Library Gould Auditorium
September 29: 11:30 A.M. – 4:45 P.M. & September 30: 8:00 A.M. – 2:00 P.M.